

YEARBOOK  
OF THE  
INTERNATIONAL  
LAW COMMISSION

2000

*Volume I*

*Summary records  
of the meetings  
of the fifty-second session  
1 May–9 June and  
10 July–18 August 2000*

---

UNITED NATIONS  
New York and Geneva, 2005



## NOTE

Symbols of United Nations documents are composed of capital letters combined with figures. Mention of such a symbol indicates a reference to a United Nations document.

References to the *Yearbook of the International Law Commission* are abbreviated to *Yearbook ...*, followed by the year (for example, *Yearbook . . . 1998*).

The *Yearbook* for each session of the International Law Commission comprises two volumes:

Volume I: summary records of the meetings of the session;

Volume II (Part One): reports of special rapporteurs and other documents considered during the session;

Volume II (Part Two): report of the Commission to the General Assembly.

All references to these works and quotations from them relate to the final printed texts of the volumes of the *Yearbook* issued as United Nations publications.

\*

\* \*

This volume contains the summary records of the meetings of the fifty-second session of the Commission (A/CN.4/SR.2612-A/CN.4/SR.2664), with the corrections requested by members of the Commission and such editorial changes as were considered necessary.

A/CN.4/SER.A/2000

UNITED NATIONS PUBLICATION
<i>Sales No.:</i> E.03.V.6 ISBN 92-1-133530-2
<i>Complete set of two volumes:</i> ISBN 92-1-133533-7
ISSN 0082-8289

## CONTENTS

	Page		Page
<b>Members of the Commission</b> .....	vi	<b>2619th meeting</b>	
<b>Officers</b> .....	vii	<i>Thursday, 11 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
<b>Agenda</b> .....	viii	Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
<b>Abbreviations</b> .....	ix	First report of the special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	56
<b>Cases cited in the present volume</b> .....	x	<b>2620th meeting</b>	
<b>Multilateral instruments cited in the present volume</b> .....	xvii	<i>Friday, 12 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
<b>Checklist of documents of the fifty-second session</b> .....	xxiii	Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
		First report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	64
SUMMARY RECORDS OF THE 2612th TO 2664th MEETINGS		<b>2621st meeting</b>	
<i>Summary records of the first part of the fifty-second session, held at Geneva from 1 May to 9 June 2000</i>		<i>Tuesday, 16 May 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>	
<b>2612th meeting</b>		State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
<i>Monday, 1 May 2000, at 3.10 p.m.</i>		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	72
Opening of the session .....	1	<b>2622nd meeting</b>	
Election of officers.....	1	<i>Wednesday, 17 May 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>	
Adoption of the agenda.....	2	State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Organization of work of the session .....	2	Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	80
Filling of casual vacancies (article 11 of the statute).....	2	Organization of work of the session ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	87
Organization of work of the session ( <i>continued</i> ).....	2	<b>2623rd meeting</b>	
<b>2613th meeting</b>		<i>Thursday, 18 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
<i>Tuesday, 2 May 2000, at 10.10 a.m.</i>		State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Organization of work of the session ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	2	Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	88
State responsibility		<b>2624th meeting</b>	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur .....	2	<i>Friday, 19 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
<b>2614th meeting</b>		Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
<i>Wednesday, 3 May 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		First report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	93
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		Unilateral acts of States	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	11	Third report of the Special Rapporteur .....	96
<b>2615th meeting</b>		<b>2625th meeting</b>	
<i>Thursday, 4 May 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		<i>Tuesday, 23 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	18	First report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	100
<b>2616th meeting</b>		<b>2626th meeting</b>	
<i>Friday, 5 May 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		<i>Wednesday, 24 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	26	First report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	108
Organization of work of the session ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	35	<b>2627th meeting</b>	
<b>2617th meeting</b>		<i>Thursday, 25 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
<i>Tuesday, 9 May 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
Diplomatic protection		First report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	116
First report of the Special Rapporteur.....	35	<b>2628th meeting</b>	
<b>2618th meeting</b>		<i>Friday, 26 May 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>	
<i>Wednesday, 10 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>		International liability for injurious consequences arising out of acts not prohibited by international law (prevention of transboundary damage from hazardous activities)	
Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )		Report of the Working Group.....	124
First report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	46	Unilateral acts of States ( <i>continued</i> )	
		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	125

	<i>Page</i>		<i>Page</i>
<b>2629th meeting</b>		<b>2640th meeting</b>	
<i>Tuesday, 30 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>		<i>Friday, 14 July 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
Unilateral acts of States ( <i>continued</i> )		State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	130	Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	217
<b>2630th meeting</b>		Reservations to treaties ( <i>continued</i> )	
<i>Wednesday 31 May 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>		Draft guidelines proposed by the Drafting Committee .....	222
Unilateral acts of States ( <i>continued</i> )		<b>2641st meeting</b>	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	138	<i>Tuesday, 18 July 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>	
Reservations to treaties		International liability for injurious consequences arising out	
Fifth report of the Special Rapporteur .....	145	of acts not prohibited by international law (prevention	
<b>2631st meeting</b>		of transboundary damage from hazardous activities)	
<i>Friday, 2 June 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		( <i>continued</i> )	
Reservations to treaties ( <i>continued</i> )		Third report of the Special Rapporteur.....	226
Fifth report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	148	<b>2642nd meeting</b>	
<b>2632nd meeting</b>		<i>Wednesday, 19 July 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
<i>Tuesday, 6 June 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>		International liability for injurious consequences arising out	
Reservations to treaties ( <i>continued</i> )		of acts not prohibited by international law (prevention	
Fifth report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	155	of transboundary damage from hazardous activities)	
<b>2633rd meeting</b>		( <i>continued</i> )	
<i>Wednesday, 7 June 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	233
Reservations to treaties ( <i>continued</i> )		<b>2643rd meeting</b>	
Fifth report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	163	<i>Thursday, 20 July 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>	
Unilateral acts of States ( <i>concluded</i> )		International liability for injurious consequences arising out	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>concluded</i> ) .....	167	of acts not prohibited by international law (prevention	
<b>2634th meeting</b>		of transboundary damage from hazardous activities)	
<i>Thursday, 8 June 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		( <i>concluded</i> )	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>concluded</i> ) .....	241
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	171	State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
<b>2635th meeting</b>		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	245
<i>Friday, 9 June 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		<b>2644th meeting</b>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		<i>Friday, 21 July 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	178	State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Diplomatic protection ( <i>concluded</i> ) .....	183	Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	249
Organization of work of the session ( <i>concluded</i> ) .....	185	<b>2645th meeting</b>	
Gilberto Amado Memorial Lecture.....	186	<i>Tuesday 25 July 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>	
		State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	257
<i>Summary records of the second part of the fifty-second session,</i>		<b>2646th meeting</b>	
<i>held at Geneva from 10 July to 18 August 2000</i>		<i>Wednesday, 26 July 2000, at 10. a.m.</i>	
<b>2636th meeting</b>		State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
<i>Monday, 10 July 2000, at 3.05 p.m.</i>		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	267
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		<b>2647th meeting</b>	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	187	<i>Thursday, 27 July 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
<b>2637th meeting</b>		State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
<i>Tuesday, 11 July 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	276
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		<b>2648th meeting</b>	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	192	<i>Friday, 28 July 2000, at 10. a.m.</i>	
<b>2638th meeting</b>		State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
<i>Wednesday, 12 July 2000, at 10. a.m.</i>		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	283
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		Cooperation with other bodies	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	201	Statement by the Observer for the Inter-American Juridical	
<b>2639th meeting</b>		Committee.....	289
<i>Thursday, 13 July 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>		<b>2649th meeting</b>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )		<i>Tuesday, 1 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	210	State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
		Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	291

<i>Page</i>	<i>Page</i>
<b>2650th meeting</b>	
<i>Wednesday, 2 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	302
<b>2651st meeting</b>	
<i>Thursday, 3 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	311
Reservations to treaties ( <i>concluded</i> )	
Fifth report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	317
<b>2652nd meeting</b>	
<i>Friday, 4 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>continued</i> ).....	321
<b>2653rd meeting</b>	
<i>Tuesday, 8 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
Third report of the Special Rapporteur ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	331
<b>2654th meeting</b>	
<i>Thursday, 10 August 2000, at 12.10 p.m.</i>	
Cooperation with other bodies ( <i>continued</i> )	
Statement by the Observer for the Asian-African Legal Consultative Committee.....	339
<b>2655th meeting</b>	
<i>Friday, 11 August 2000, at 10.05 a.m.</i>	
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session.....	341
Chapter I. Organization of the session.....	341
Chapter II. Summary of the work of the Commission at its fifty-second session.....	341
Chapter V. Diplomatic protection	
A. Introduction.....	342
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session....	342
Cooperation with other bodies ( <i>continued</i> )	
Statement by the Observer for the Ad Hoc Committee of Legal Advisers on Public International Law.....	344
<b>2656th meeting</b>	
<i>Monday, 14 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>continued</i> )	
Chapter VI. Unilateral acts of States.....	347
A. Introduction.....	347
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session	
1. Documents before the Commission and meetings devoted to the topic.....	347
2. Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of his third report.....	347
3. Summary of the debate.....	348
4. Establishment of the Working Group.....	351
<b>2657th meeting</b>	
<i>Monday, 14 August 2000, at 3.05 p.m.</i>	
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>continued</i> )	
Chapter VI. Unilateral acts of States ( <i>concluded</i> )	
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session ( <i>concluded</i> )	
4. Establishment of the Working Group ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	352
2. Introduction by the Special Rapporteur of his third report ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	353
3. Summary of the debate ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	353
Chapter VIII. International liability for injurious consequences arising out of acts not prohibited by interna-	
tional law (prevention of transboundary damage from hazardous activities)	
A. Introduction.....	353
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session....	353
<b>2658th meeting</b>	
<i>Tuesday, 15 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
Cooperation with other bodies ( <i>concluded</i> )	
Visit by the President of the International Court of Justice	357
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>continued</i> )	
Chapter V. Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session ( <i>continued</i> ).....	364
<b>2659th meeting</b>	
<i>Tuesday, 15 August 2000, at 3.05 p.m.</i>	
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>continued</i> )	
Chapter V. Diplomatic protection ( <i>continued</i> )	
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session ( <i>continued</i> ).....	365
Chapter VII. Reservations to treaties	
A. Introduction.....	368
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session....	368
C. Text of the draft guidelines on reservations to treaties provisionally adopted by the Commission on first reading	
1. Text of the draft guidelines.....	370
2. Text of the draft guidelines with commentaries thereto adopted by the Commission at its fifty-second session.....	370
Commentary to guideline 1.1.8.....	370
Commentary to guideline 1.4.6 [1.4.6, 1.4.7].....	370
Commentary to guideline 1.4.7 [1.4.8].....	371
Commentary to guideline 1.7.....	371
<b>2660th meeting</b>	
<i>Wednesday, 16 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>	
Programme, procedures and working methods of the Commission, and its documentation	
Report of the Chairman of the Planning Group.....	371
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>continued</i> )	
Chapter VII. Reservations to treaties ( <i>concluded</i> )	
C. Text of the draft guidelines on reservations to treaties provisionally adopted by the Commission on first reading ( <i>concluded</i> )	
2. Text of the draft guidelines with commentaries thereto adopted by the Commission at its fifty-second session ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	372
Commentary to guideline 1.7.1 [1.7.1, 1.7.2, 1.7.3, 1.7.4].....	372
Commentary to guideline 1.7.2 [1.7.5].....	373
Chapter IV. State responsibility.....	373
A. Introduction.....	373
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session....	374
<b>2661st meeting</b>	
<i>Wednesday, 16 August 2000, at 3.05 p.m.</i>	
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>continued</i> )	
Chapter V. Diplomatic protection ( <i>concluded</i> )	
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session ( <i>concluded</i> ).....	379
Chapter IV. State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> )	
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session ( <i>continued</i> ).....	380
<b>2662nd meeting</b>	
<i>Thursday, 17 August 2000, at 10.10 a.m.</i>	
State responsibility ( <i>concluded</i> )	
Draft articles proposed by the Drafting Committee on second reading.....	386

	<i>Page</i>		<i>Page</i>
<b>2663rd meeting</b>		Chapter IX. Other decisions and conclusions of the Commission	
<i>Thursday, 17 August 2000, at 3.05 p.m.</i>		A. Programme, procedures and working methods of the Commission, and its documentation .....	409
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>continued</i> )		B. Date and place of the fifty-third session .....	410
Chapter IV. State responsibility ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	401	C. Cooperation with other bodies .....	410
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session ( <i>continued</i> ) .....	401	D. Representation at the fifty-fifth session of the General Assembly .....	410
<b>2664th meeting</b>		E. International Law Seminar .....	410
<i>Friday, 18 August 2000, at 10 a.m.</i>		F. Gilberto Amado Memorial Lecture .....	410
Draft report of the Commission on the work of its fifty-second session ( <i>concluded</i> )		Chapter III. Specific issues on which comments would be of particular interest to the Commission .....	410
Chapter IV. State responsibility ( <i>concluded</i> )		Chapter II. Summary of the work of the Commission at its fifty-second session ( <i>concluded</i> ) .....	410
B. Consideration of the topic at the present session ( <i>concluded</i> ) .....	407	Closure of the session .....	410